

## **The Impact of Migration in the South West- Evidence Base**

1. Briefly describe **migration context in your region**, including whether this has altered over the past five years. (This could include volumes, nationalities, ages, geographic location and reasons for migration of foreign-born people.)

The accession of ten new members of the EU on the 1 May 2004 is widely reported as having led to significant in-migration to the region. The total number of National Insurance registrations by foreign nationals rose from 15,835 in 2003-04 to 23,065 in 2004-05 and then to 33,720 in 2005/06 (Department for Work and Pensions). It is estimated that about four fifths of the increase from 2003 to 2004 was made up of accession country citizens. Between May 2004 and December 2006 48,920 migrants signed up to employment in the South West according to the Workers Registration Scheme. Of these 21,070 were in 2006 alone.

According to the NINO data the largest concentrations of migrants (over 1000 registrations in 2005/06) are in the major urban areas of Bristol (where there were over 5000 registrations in 2005/06) Exeter, Cheltenham, Gloucester, Bath and North East Somerset, North Somerset, South Gloucestershire, Plymouth, Bournemouth and Swindon. However the biggest changes, in percentage terms, since EU enlargement in May 2004 have been in the rural areas with NINO registrations growing by over 600% (from 2003/04 to 2005/06) in Kerrier, over 400% in Penwith and over 200% in 11 other rural districts. Registrations in Cornwall have grown by 317.2%, the largest percentage increase of the counties and unitaries<sup>i</sup>. Consequently the impact is likely to be felt most strongly in the rural areas.

Between 2000 and 2005 28.1% of migrants receiving NINOs were employed in catering or hospitality. 20% worked in factories or production, 6% in professional and management employment, 5.9% in care and nursing homes and 5.5% in retail. Whereas only 3.5% worked in agriculture, about 23% of WRS workers registered for employment in sector between May 2004 and September 2005 implying that the NINO figures may undercount the relative importance of migration in rural areas where more workers may use the WRS.

Of the 33,720 workers who received NINOs in 2005/06 about 51% were from the new EU states, of which 11,330 (33.6%) were Poles, 2,030 were from Slovakia and 1,220 were from Lithuania<sup>ii</sup>.

For the region as a whole there is a roughly 50:50 split amongst migrant workers between men and women<sup>iii</sup>. Over 90% of migrant workers are aged 18-44 and most are thought to be without their families, though 7% are aged 45-59, the second highest category in the country<sup>iv</sup>.

Migrant workers, particularly in rural areas, are often moving from one area to the next and often into and out of the region quite regularly. This makes it more difficult to estimate numbers (see below). School data can provide a

more permanent picture of the number of migrants, though it too has its flaws (see below).

The main sectors in which migrants are employed vary between different parts of the region. In Cornwall there are large concentrations of tourist workers (roughly 50.5% if bar and waiting staff are included. A survey of employers revealed that over 60% of the sampled workforce was Polish and 27% Lithuanian. In contrast, the largest group in Somerset are Portuguese (42.2%). In Gloucestershire the primary areas of migrant employment are the hotel/catering sector and security. A large number of migrant Community groups have been set up including Polski Bristol, the Somerset Polish Community and the Somerset Portuguese Association.

There is a widespread consensus amongst private, public and voluntary sector that migrant workers have made a strong positive contribution to the region's economy and have enabled certain sectors of the economy to boom. Unfortunately migrant workers are often at a disadvantage in the labour market. With poor knowledge of their rights at work they are more likely to be subject to poor working conditions and practices, low levels of pay and are often excluded from services such as health care and training<sup>v</sup>.

At the end of June 2007 there were a total of 1588 asylum seekers being supported by BIA. Of these 1128 people received the total support package under Section 95, 106 Subsistence only and 354 under Section 4. This indicates a slight increase on the previous year but it is impossible to be definite due to the continuing uncertainty within BIA regarding Section 4 numbers.

Destitution of asylum seekers whose applications have not been successful continues to be an issue and in some areas food parcels are being distributed by the voluntary sector to support these people.

2. What evidence is there of **challenges due to migration** in your region? Please also consider specific geographic locations, particular public services and identifiable migrant groups where this is possible.

There are a large number of research reports on migration in the South West as well as a considerable amount of anecdotal evidence collected by groups like the South West Migrant Worker Action Group (SW MIGWAG). Last year the South West Local Government Association carried out a survey which asked Local Authorities to record any pressures on public services and problems of exploitation and community cohesion.

### Experiences in the Workplace

There is evidence of systematic exploitation of migrant workers by gang masters who organise workers to come to the UK and then make unfair deductions for food, uniforms and accommodation often of a very low standard e.g. the South West TUC has found evidence of skilled migrant workers in Falmouth docks being paid the minimum wage but having pay deducted for items such payslips or electricity. Poor language skills, fear of

being sacked and lack of knowledge of employment rights prevent many migrants from challenging such exploitation. For example, migrant workers may be denied holiday pay as employers know that they do not risk committing a civil offence by not notifying their workers.

Many migrant workers are misled by their employment agencies about the terms and conditions that they can expect when they arrive in England. In one case highlighted by the Guardian<sup>vi</sup> a number of Polish workers were told they would be working near Southampton but were instead taken in a van to Exeter. There they were charged £40 rent a week for sleeping on the floor in overcrowded accommodation and threatened with eviction if they told anyone. Kerrier Citizens Advice Bureau was approached by a group of similarly misled Portuguese workers who wanted to return home <sup>vii</sup>. Portuguese migrants working for a large food processing plant in Chard have been found to work 81 hours a week, to be charged £60 for accommodation and to be obliged to use company transport for which pay is deducted<sup>viii</sup>.

The Gangmasters Licensing Authority currently lacks the resources to sufficiently tackle such exploitation. There is currently only one Enforcement Officer in the whole region<sup>ix</sup>. Furthermore the South West TUC has reported that many Gangmasters are moving into construction where the Agency has no jurisdiction. Many migrants are employed by agencies and often have much worse terms of employment than their fellow workers, employed directly by the company. Government action to reduce the discrepancy of agency and company employment would be welcome.

### ESOL Provision

There is considerable evidence of pressure on ESOL provision throughout the South West as demand has clearly outstripped supply<sup>x</sup>. This problem has been exacerbated by the Government's decision to reduce the number of migrants eligible for free lessons and to deny free lessons to Asylum Seekers and those not given permanent leave to remain. This will have implications for community cohesion and for the contribution of migrants to the region's economy (see below). Stakeholders throughout the region are hoping to use ESF funding to support ESOL provision for migrant workers (but not Asylum Seekers) though this will only scratch the surface.

Link into Learning, which provides skills for adults with lower skill levels in Cornwall, took time to adjust to a vastly increased demand for ESOL from migrant workers, following enlargement. By 2006 half of the students at Link to Learning in Launceston were taking ESOL. Part of the problem is that many migrant workers do not speak any English when they arrive and so require some one to one support. The organisation responded by increasing staffing together with the number of courses offered<sup>xi</sup>. In South Somerset the number of students enrolled in English language classes rose from 96 (2003/4) to 307 (2005/6) and the Council believes that current provision is insufficient to meet this demand<sup>xii</sup>.

Increased demand is not the only issue with ESOL provision. LSC funding for Skills for Life is not flexible to the needs of migrant workers as subsidies are

only available for the full qualification and many migrants have intermittent attendance patterns influenced by seasonal employment and workplace closure patterns<sup>xiii</sup>.

### Schools

A report by the South West Local Government Association found that there has been a considerable increase in the number of pupils for whom English is an Additional Language (EAL pupils), since EU enlargement. Much of the growth in numbers has been in urban areas where there are a range of established communities but some of the biggest increases in percentage terms were in rural areas. In Cornwall the number of EAL pupils was estimated to grow by 56.4% and in North Somerset by 58.8% from 2004 to 2006 and in Somerset it was estimated to grow by about 55% from 2005 to 2007<sup>xiv</sup>. Somerset County Council told SWLGA that School staff were often concerned that they did not have enough resources to deal with the increased number of EAL pupils but that the confidence of the staff increased with experience. In Wiltshire Polish teaching assistants were hired although the demand on their time has increased to a very high rate. At the time of the SWLGA survey they were looking to employ a Portuguese assistant but were limited by resources. Some pressure has also been identified in Devon by the migrant worker task group there.

### Housing

SWLGA's survey of Local Authorities reported there had been surprisingly little impact on housing services. Only one council, South Hams, reported any real pressure and this was on private stock as a result of employers seeking accommodation for their workers. Four Councils specifically stated that the impact on housing was minimal or non-existent. Bristol City Council also found very little impact on housing services<sup>xv</sup>.

However several Authorities reported that migrants in their areas were victims of overcrowding, accommodation with poor health and safety conditions and/or extortionate rents (which is dealt with under experiences in the workplace). This could create demand for social housing in the future. Many migrants find it difficult to access housing. The Cornwall Strategic Partnership found that the Portuguese community were hindered not only financially but also by the fact that agencies only allow couples to rent.

Housing is also a major issue for Asylum Seekers as the lack of public housing in the region makes it very difficult for them to move on when NASS support is terminated.

### Crime and Community Cohesion

Few Local Authorities surveyed by SWLGA reported incidences in this area but West Wiltshire did report that there had been criminal incidences involving migrant workers and this had increased community tension. Kerrier also reported a large increase in road traffic accidents, drink driving and untaxed vehicles, linked to migrant workers. This has prompted the

Responsible Employer Scheme (see below). Other problems in Kerrier included the use of Migrants as prostitutes and the concern that some are forced into it, and the presence of protection rackets.

There is some evidence that Migration has led to hostility amongst the “indigenous” population. In Chard, in Somerset, the local sign was changed to say “welcome to Portugal”. There were also racist attacks and local action by the BNP linked to the food processing plant cited above<sup>xvi</sup>.

The employment of migrants can sometimes evoke a positive response from the already existing workforce. This was the case for existing workers at Hygrade Foods in Chippenham who had previously been seriously overstretched<sup>xvii</sup>. Local Authorities should be encouraged to use the Institute of Community Cohesion’s Tension Monitoring Toolkit.

There is not yet sufficient information on the experiences of migrant workers trying to integrate with their local community. A survey of migrants was carried out by the Local Intelligence Network Cornwall (LINC) for the Cornwall Strategic Partnership. Of the three groups interviewed, two found it difficult to integrate and felt the Cornish were unfriendly<sup>xviii</sup>. Further surveys of local employers and migrant workers are currently being carried out, for example in Gloucestershire, and this will increase the information we have.

#### Library and Internet Services

Pressure on library computer services has posed a challenge for some Local Authorities. The Devon Scoping Report found evidence of pressure on availability, particularly in the summer. The pressure was particularly acute in coastal holiday resorts, such as Sidmouth and Exmouth, and in the larger libraries, such as Exeter Central and Barnstaple. Exeter Library has reported day long queues, sometimes of 18 or more and the “indigenous” community are often resentful that this may limit their access. Many of them do not realise migrants pay income and council tax and feel that migrants should not receive free access<sup>xix</sup>. There may be a need for increased provision and for a programme of “myth busting”.

#### Asylum Seekers & Refugees

Unlike migrant workers, Asylum Seekers cannot choose where to live and are concentrated in dispersal areas. These five dispersal areas are geographically widespread. Refugee Action who are funded by the Home Office as the “One Stop” service only have resources to operate in Bristol and Plymouth. The service in other dispersal areas is provided by small voluntary sector groups who receive no central government funding. This places a great strain on them. Another factor that has had an impact is that with the new accommodation contracts the accommodation providers are unable to provide the same range of support that had previously existed. It is also proving difficult to provide an adequate level of legal advice for this group.

<p>3. What evidence is there of <b>opportunities created by migration</b> in your region? Please also consider specific geographic locations, particular public services and identifiable migrant groups where this is possible.</p>
--

## Economic Growth

In terms of the South west, the region's growth in the last 10 years has been entirely the result of migration (including internal UK migration), as the region has experienced more deaths than births in each year<sup>xx</sup>. Part of the South West's success is measured in the fact that it has attracted relatively high rates of inward migration. This population growth can fuel regional economic and productivity growth particularly in the medium and long term

Several of the Authorities which responded to SWLGA's survey emphasised the positive impact of migration on the local economy. South Hams and Salisbury District Councils reported that migrants are making up for local labour shortages and West Wiltshire stated that they are often employed in work which is shunned by "indigenous workers". Dartmoor National Park Authority reported that the area's tourism, care homes and dental services rely on migrant workers. Salisbury also reported that migrants are a particularly important part of the local workforce particularly in the hospitality sector, which is a major source of jobs and a very important sector throughout the whole South West region.

Where interviews of employers have taken positive views of migrants have generally been made. A survey of employers in Cornwall carried out by LINC revealed that many employers in the area employed migrants because they were keen and punctual workers<sup>xxi</sup>. Many also wanted to fill gaps created by a lack of local labour. 18 of the 108 surveyed felt they would probably not continue in business without migrant workers. A telephone interview of employers in South Somerset also obtained many positive responses although many employers cited communication skills as a major factor in employment decisions<sup>xxii</sup>. This suggests that a lack of ESOL provision could hinder migration's positive economic impacts.

The South West has an ageing population and many of its care homes are facing a chronic shortage of suitably qualified workers. Consequently many care homes have employed applicants from countries in Eastern Europe, some of whom have spent time working in an English speaking country. 7% of migrant workers in Cornwall, for example, are employed in the care sector<sup>xxiii</sup>. Rosewell Care Home in Bristol recruited workers from Zimbabwe, the Philippines and Poland.

## Skills

Evidence suggests that many migrants are highly skilled and also that some migrants are not working in jobs which are appropriate to their skills and qualifications. The LINC survey found that while 36% of employers surveyed believed their workers were skilled but not over qualified, 23% felt they were overqualified for the job they were doing<sup>xxiv</sup>. This suggests there is still untapped opportunity for increased productivity resulting from migration.

**4. What good practices or innovative solutions does your region currently have in place to manage any transitional impacts of migration from the public, private or voluntary sectors?**

There are number of examples of best practice within the region. The Regional Strategic Co-ordination Board has extended its brief to cover migrant workers as well as asylum seekers and refugees. There are to be two subgroups, one of which (the already existing South West Migrant Worker Action Group) will focus on regional issues in relation to migrant workers. This group has already started to meet and brings together key partners across the region to identify and address regional issues in relation to migrant workers.

The Cornwall Strategic Partnership has set up a Migrant Worker Task Group which has produced a very detailed multi-lingual welcome pack for migrants. The group is also involved in setting up a Responsible Employers Scheme through which companies distribute welcome packs to their employees and help ensure they are aware of the laws on driving. Member companies will be required to conform to guidelines on employment and to allow the police a minimum of four visits a year. Partners include the South West TUC, the Health and Safety Executive, Cornwall Fire Service and Jobcentre Plus.

Kerrier and Penwith District Councils also set up a Migrant Worker Action Group including the Police, probationary services, environmental health and housing services, which enabled them to support the Police and the GLA in cracking down on exploitation and poor accommodation in the area.<sup>xxv</sup> The group has agreed an Information Sharing Protocol and created a shared database listing employers, accommodation providers and workers as well as conditions found during inspection. It can be used gauge migrant numbers but also to help tackle exploitation and unacceptable accommodation<sup>xxvi</sup>.

A Migrant Worker Task Group has also recently been set up in Devon and has drawn up an action plan to present to the Devon Strategic Partnership. The group is working on a welcome pack for Devon and on a 'fact and myth buster guide'. It is also working to improve ESOL provision through 'English @ Work in Devon'<sup>xxvii</sup>.

South Somerset District Council has developed a website for new arrivals to the district, including migrant workers (<http://www.newtosomerset.com>) which gives advice on areas such as schools, doctors and waste disposal.

Project PA8 in Plymouth provides advice and advocacy for migrants, including a help line, drop-in service and a website. ESOL training is provided every Sunday (as work prevents many migrants attending during the week) and the organisation has also worked to promote integration with the local community by encouraging the participation of Eastern Europeans in Plymouth Sports Bug Week and National Heritage events<sup>xxviii</sup>.

In the health and social care sector a good example of best practice is Hygia which was formed in August 2003 to provide training and NVQ assessment

and which has provided programmes for overseas staff that have been drafted in without prior experience<sup>xxix</sup>.

**5. What do you consider are the key gaps or limitations in our knowledge about the wider impacts (both challenges and opportunities) of migration?**

The obvious difficulty with measuring the wider impacts of Migration is that we are uncertain about how many migrants there are. There are a number of different data sets and only some of them can be used on a regional and local level. Whilst information is available to some extent on migrants coming into the region there is little information about those leaving and how many are staying, making planning and impact/ needs assessment problematic.

Both NINOs and WRS figures tell nothing about migrant families and while most migrants will have come alone initially, in the long run many of the more permanent settlers may bring their families over. There are also problems with EAL figures, including the fact that they do not distinguish between recent migrant children and the children of established communities who keep their original language and that it says nothing about children not yet of school age. An idea of numbers here could be crucial in ensuring that public services have the skills and resources to meet these needs.

To get a clear view of the opportunities and challenges existing in any region there needs to be more information about the potential of migrant's themselves. As we have seen migrant workers often find themselves carrying out jobs for which they over-skilled or over-qualified, however many businesses and public bodies may not be aware of this untapped potential. Employers have little way of knowing the qualifications of migrant workers if they were obtained abroad and many migrants will not have suitable knowledge of where to go for employment advice and how to get vocational training which could develop their skills. Likewise there is a need to identify sectors where migrants are not usually employed but where they could make up for skill shortages.

There is also a need to ascertain whether is any impact on wage suppression and unemployment amongst "indigenous workers" and to see whether migrants are complementing or substituting for "indigenous workers". This would need to include not just the immediate impact of migration but also the impacts on productivity which could encourage employment growth in the long run.

Whilst there is anecdotal evidence of discrimination and exploitation more in depth analysis of the equality and community cohesion aspects of migration is needed. This is made more difficult by the fact that gangmasters involved in exploitation will do their best to hide it from the authorities. The limited resources and jurisdiction of the GLA mean that many cases of exploitation may go unnoticed.

There is also a problem of measuring the impact of migration on public services as some of the data sources may overstate this. EAL data, for example, may include pupils from established communities and could represent migration which has happened much less recently.

#### **6. How could these evidence gaps be filled?**

Regarding the overall numbers of migrants at both regional and local level, some national guidance (probably from the Office for National Statistics) on how different data sources, such as NINOs, the WRS and EAL figures could be combined could be helpful when making broad estimates. The guidance could suggest ways of mitigating for the drawbacks of current data, perhaps through local sampling but also national estimates.

Regarding EAL data it would be helpful if Local Authority school surveys could distinguish between pupils from established communities and those from more recent migrant communities. The data collected by the Department for Children, Schools and Families should also include pupils who aren't yet of school age and those in nursery education (as some Local Authorities do) as migrants are more likely to be younger parents.

Regarding the skills potential of migrant workers, it would be useful to have more employer and migrant surveys (possibly at the regional level) to audit such skills, which could be carried out with the help of local employer's organisations and the regional TUC. Ultimately better knowledge and availability of career advice and training programmes would allow migrants to apply their skills to the parts of the labour market which are most appropriate to them. There also needs to be some mechanism for checking the validity of qualifications obtained overseas and for applying them to the UK labour market qualifications gained overseas (EURES could provide some help in this area). Ultimately increased ESOL provision would help to unlock much of this potential.

In order to uncover incidences of exploitation more funding will need to be provided for the Gangmaster's Licensing Authority so that more Enforcement Officers can be employed. Its jurisdiction may also need to be extended to cover all sectors where migrants are at risk of exploitation, such as construction, so that it is aligned with the Health and Safety Executive.

Migrants themselves are best placed to inform Local Authorities and regional organisations about many of the issues discussed above. Currently a large number of migrant worker community groups are being set up throughout the region. Most of these groups represent specific communities, are under-resourced and may only function at a very local level. A regional network of such organisations or a series of regional consultation exercises would be helpful in translating the views and experiences of migrants to Local Authorities and regional organisations. Something like this has been suggested by members of SW MIGWAG, although the group is restricted by the limited funding provided by the Enabling Grant.

Ultimately more information on the local level is required in order to meet the challenges and opportunities posed by migration. Several Counties and Districts already have their own migrant worker action groups but ideally there should be local groups in every area of the region. This would make it easier for the GLA to engage with local stakeholders. The West Cornish practice of a shared database of local employers and their workers should be exemplified. Central Government could encourage this.

- 
- <sup>i</sup> Hiscock, (2006) *Migrant Workers in Somerset*, (Somerset County Council)
- <sup>ii</sup> Evans et al, (2006) *Migrant Workers: The Challenge for the South West, Learning Theme Report* (South West Observatory Skills & Learning Intelligence Module/ Marchmont Observatory, University of Exeter) at <http://www.swslim.org.uk/documents/themes/lt12-report.pdf>
- <sup>iii</sup> Evans et al (2006)
- <sup>iv</sup> Evans et al (2006)
- <sup>v</sup> Equality South West
- <sup>vi</sup> [http://www.guardian.co.uk/uk\\_news/story/0,,1387248,00.html#article\\_continue](http://www.guardian.co.uk/uk_news/story/0,,1387248,00.html#article_continue)
- <sup>vii</sup> South West TUC & Jobcentre Plus (2005), *Migrant Working in the South West*
- <sup>viii</sup> South West TUC & Jobcentre Plus (2005)
- <sup>ix</sup> Information obtained from the Gangmasters Licensing Authority at SW MIGWAG meetings
- <sup>x</sup> Evans et al (2006)
- <sup>xi</sup> Evans et al (2006)
- <sup>xii</sup> South Somerset
- <sup>xiii</sup> Evans et al (2006)
- <sup>xiv</sup> Dorr (2007), *English as an Additional Language (EAL) in South West Schools* (South West Local Government Association)
- <sup>xv</sup> Ayensu, L. (2006), *Briefing- International (Migrant) Workers in the South West* (Bristol City Council, Asylum and Refugee Integration Team)
- <sup>xvi</sup> South West TUC & Jobcentre Plus (2005)
- <sup>xvii</sup> Evans et al (2006)
- <sup>xviii</sup> Local Intelligence Network Cornwall (2006), *Migrant Workers: Report into Issues Affecting Migrant Workers in Cornwall* (commissioned by Cornwall Strategic Partnership; funded by Government Office South West) at [http://www.cornwallstatistics.org.uk/media/pdf/7/r/Migrant\\_Workers\\_Survey\\_Report\\_2006.pdf](http://www.cornwallstatistics.org.uk/media/pdf/7/r/Migrant_Workers_Survey_Report_2006.pdf)
- <sup>xix</sup> Davies & Rolls (2007), *Migrant Workers: Scoping the Issues for Devon*, April 2007, (Community Council Devon)
- <sup>xx</sup> State of the South West, 2007
- <sup>xxi</sup> Local Intelligence Network Cornwall (2006)
- <sup>xxii</sup> Caller, *Migrant Workers in South Somerset: A look at the language needs and information that may help migrant workers to settle in South Somerset* (South Somerset District Council) at [http://www.southsomerset.gov.uk/media/pdf/d/s/Migrant\\_worker\\_reportFINALDRAFT.pdf](http://www.southsomerset.gov.uk/media/pdf/d/s/Migrant_worker_reportFINALDRAFT.pdf)
- <sup>xxiii</sup> South West TUC & Jobcentre Plus (2005)
- <sup>xxiv</sup> Local Intelligence Network Cornwall (2006)
- <sup>xxv</sup> GLA press release at: [http://www.gla.gov.uk/embedded\\_object.asp?id=1013079](http://www.gla.gov.uk/embedded_object.asp?id=1013079) see also [http://www.devon-cornwall.police.uk/v3/news/billboard/june07/bill15\\_04.pdf](http://www.devon-cornwall.police.uk/v3/news/billboard/june07/bill15_04.pdf)
- <sup>xxvi</sup> see [http://www.kerrier.gov.uk/media/adobe/e/9/Cabinet\\_060627\\_Report\\_-\\_Item\\_5d\(2\).pdf](http://www.kerrier.gov.uk/media/adobe/e/9/Cabinet_060627_Report_-_Item_5d(2).pdf)
- <sup>xxvii</sup> Davies & Rolls (2007)
- <sup>xxviii</sup> Evans et al (2006)
- <sup>xxix</sup> Evans et al (2006)